

Social Media Usage and Interactions: An In-Depth Interview on BERSIH 2.0 Social Media Visual Framing

MOHD FIRDAUZ MOHD FATHIR
ANITAWATI MOHD LOKMAN
Universiti Teknologi MARA

SHAMSIAH ABD KADIR
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia

ISMAIL SUALMAN
Universiti Teknologi MARA

ABSTRACT

The BERSIH movement in Malaysia is a coalition of civil society organizations advocating for clean and fair elections. This research examines how visual communication shapes political participation by focusing on the visual framing of the BERSIH movement. The study interviewed ten visual communication experts to uncover the meanings and ideological representations behind the visual frames used in the movement. The investigation identified three main themes: portrayal of the crowd, significant individuals, and injustice. The portrayal of the crowd theme highlighted the use of visuals to create a sense of unity and solidarity among participants, while the significant individuals theme emphasized the importance of visual representations of influential figures in shaping people's perceptions. The injustice theme highlighted the use of visuals to expose the injustices and inequality within the electoral system. The study found that visual framing plays a significant role in shaping people's attitudes towards political participation. Neutral or cool visual elements can evoke strong feelings and attract people to the cause, demonstrating that visual elements play a vital role in political mobilization. The findings suggest that carefully crafting visual frames can evoke strong emotional responses and encourage participation in political action. This research sheds light on the power of visual communication in shaping political participation in Malaysia's social movements and highlights the need for a strategic approach in creating visuals that appeal to people's emotions and encourage political engagement.

Keywords: *Visual framing, social movement, social media, politics, Malaysia.*

INTRODUCTION

In contemporary society, there has been a noticeable increase in attention towards the phenomenon of protest and social movements. According to Mattoni and Teune (2014), various academic disciplines have examined the visual components of such phenomena. Media scholars, for example, have analyzed how activists utilize media in social movements, while public and commercial news outlets have framed demonstrations. Historians have focused on the visual memory of social movements, particularly the iconic images that have become emblematic of them. Social psychologists have investigated how these images affect individuals who witness protests and their potential to inspire participation. In the present era, marked by the proliferation of smartphones and social media, researchers face significant challenges in understanding the role of visual images in the development and composition of social movements. Anthropologists have examined how meaning is constructed through

images within the collective action of social movements. Given that the sharing of photographic content is considered an important contribution to the development of social movements, it is essential to comprehend what motivates media consumers to participate in this phenomenon, as well as the function of visual images in disseminating ideas in these contexts.

BERSIH stands out as a remarkable example of one of the significant social movements that have emerged in Malaysia post-Merdeka. This movement, which began with its first public protest on November 10, 2007, and ended with BERSIH 5 on November 19, 2016, made good use of social media and its users to attract attention from both domestic and international participants. It is reasonably clear that this phenomena would keep growing in the future given the tendencies in online social movements seen in Malaysia. Additionally, current social movements have shown how social media may be used effectively to draw in the public's attention, as seen with the Anti-ICERD rally, also known as Daulat 812, in 2018, which gathered some 55,000 people (Salim, 2018).

The interaction between social media and political movements has been the subject of several recent studies in the Malaysian context (Chinnasamy & Abdul Manaf, 2018; Lim, 2016; Sulaiman & Aboo Talib @ Khalid, 2017; Tye et al., 2018). Yet, the significance of images and visuals in Malaysia's social movements has received far less attention. Finding out how images influence and interact with social and political engagement in Malaysian society would be a more sophisticated and in-depth approach. Moreover, the collection of knowledge does not include any expert opinions, which may greatly improve our grasp of this subject. Hence, the research question for this study is: what are the underlying meanings of visual frames that can be identified from the visual portrayal of issues on the BERSIH Facebook Page? Consequently, the objective of this study is to investigate, from the viewpoints of specialists, the kinds of visuals that have inspired Malaysian residents to take part in the BERSIH movement.

LITERATURE REVIEW

1. *Visual Social Media and Social Movements*

Social movements have emerged as a significant mechanism for promoting or opposing social change in democratic societies. Scholars have defined social movements as a platform for society to express dissent and discontentment, particularly towards those in power (DeLuca et al., 2012). Despite the historical association of social movements with "mob psychology" or societal breakdown, contemporary understandings of social movements emphasize their role in raising awareness about issues that require societal change. Protest leaders engage in emotional labor, while participants are motivated by ideologies that may not conform to rational logic, leading to potential discrepancies between individual interests and group behavior. In addition, according to Stern et al. (1999), public support is critical in mobilizing social movements to overcome cultural inertia and powerful interests. These movements emerge spontaneously when individuals with shared perspectives and opinions come together to advocate for a particular cause or issue, without formal principles or methodology. Ultimately, social movements have the potential to demonstrate the significant impact of collective action on society and challenge existing power structures.

Recent scholarship has highlighted the growing significance of visuals in social media. The Pew Research Center has documented a rise in visual communication among frequent social media users and reported that 54% of internet users post photos, while 18% and 9% of cellphone users employed Instagram and Snapchat, respectively (Duggan & Brenner, 2013).

Moreover, recent research conducted by the Pew Research Center has demonstrated that Facebook posts receive greater user engagement when accompanied by visual elements such as pictures and photos (Hitlin & Olmstead, 2018). Gretzel (2018) has further emphasized the importance of visuals in the social media landscape, noting that their role represents a significant shift in the way content is presented and consumed.

In recent years, there has been a significant increase in both the quantity and quality of visual communication research (Bock, 2020). As a reflection of this trend, many universities now offer courses on visual literacy, and academic tracks in photojournalism and architecture are prevalent across the world. The growth of visual communication research can be attributed to several factors, including the availability of multimedia content through emerging technology and the highly visual nature of online material (Fahmy et al., 2014). However, to conduct research in visual communication, a more subjective and qualitative approach is needed. As Parry (2010) argues, quantified numbers alone cannot provide insights into the significance of an image, and it is also problematic to make generalisations about the effect of any one picture. Therefore, it is necessary to supplement findings from comprehensive context and framing research with more qualitative 'stylistic' analysis approaches.

The emergence of high-speed communication networks through the internet has had profound effects on various aspects of society, including cross-border collaborations, political movements, social transformation, and trade (Benkler, 2006). Social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter, have played a crucial role in facilitating social collaborative networks. For instance, during the Arab Spring, activists utilised these networks to mobilise citizens, organise protests, and network with other activists in neighbouring countries (Kirkpatrick & Sanger, 2011). These networked spaces enable the creation, sharing, and deletion of various modes of communication content, including text, images, videos, and audio, in one-to-one or one-to-many communication settings. The popular social media sites, Facebook and Twitter, have been instrumental in disseminating information about political movements in the Middle East and North Africa since 2010 and subsequent conflicts in the regions. The increasing penetration of the internet worldwide and in the regions, as highlighted by Zhuravskaya et al. (2020), has significantly contributed to the widespread use of these platforms. Consequently, parties involved in conflicts have used social media for their propaganda, often sharing attention-grabbing images.

While social media is widely acknowledged as a crucial tool for the development of social movements, there is limited research on its visual aspects. This is not a novel criterion as various features of media networks, including diffusion, have long been recognised as significant for political mobilisation and social research. However, network mechanisms are rarely considered in recent theoretical accounts that explain how social media is employed to coordinate collective action, despite evidence to the contrary (Bennett & Segerberg, 2012; Gerbaudo, 2015; Treré & Mattoni, 2016). Consequently, an essential analytical level is being overlooked (González-Bailón & Wang, 2016). As highlighted by Rovisco and Veneti (2017), although there is a growing body of scholarship on the production and mediation of protest images, little attention has been paid to visual research and the examination of social movements' use of visual representations of protest. This includes how such images can capture users' attention, and how protesters' "struggle to be seen" shapes and influences the design and dissemination of protest images in both mainstream and alternative media environments.

2. *Visual Framing*

In defining visual framing, many scholars have diverse interpretations of it. However, past literature had pointed to framing studies as the root and fundamental of visual framing. According to Coleman (2009) and Entman (1993), popular definition of framing can also be applied to visuals. According to Entman (1993), visual framing refers to the selection of perceived reality and their accentuation to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation and/or treatment evaluation by visual stimuli. Coleman added that visual framing is the process of selecting some aspects of a perceived reality, highlighting them above others through visual communication, and making them salient, meaningful, and memorable so that certain interpretations or evaluations of the issue described are visually promoted. This notion aligns with what Gamson and Modigliani (1989) explained: visual frames perform as highlighted pictorial configurations of reference that organize and render meaningfully selected aspects of an issue, visually suggesting its “central organizing idea”.

Subsequently, Geise (2017) contends that visual framing devices are the smallest salient, coherent, and meaningful visual units of a picture that contribute to the pictorial composition of the visual frame and thus to the activation or configuration of conceptual visual frames in the recipient’s mind. Taken together in a meaningful way, visual framing devices construct the visual media frame that the picture offers and that visually proposes the “central organizing idea.” While visual framing is not a new area in the study of framing, online visual framing on the other hand has recently emerged in the study of visual framing.

The latest conceptualization of visual framing was discussed in depth by Bock (2020) in her paper “*Theorising Visual Framing: Contingency, Materiality and Ideology*”. The paper discusses several scholars' clear gaps in understanding visual framing. Bock argues that while many scholars have contended that there is indeed a lack of in-depth discussion done on the role of visuals in framing, visual framing is an area that stands on its own. However, future directions of visual framing study need to recognise the demands of unique approaches on visual framing research with an effective and accurate tool in the scholarship.

3. *Visual Portrayal of Issues*

Within the past research of visual framing, visual has been generally divided into two levels, denotative and connotative. According to Barthes (1964), denotative is the descriptive level of literal meaning that all members of a culture compromise. As denoted by Rodriguez and Dimitrova (2011), the first level of visual framing revealed only the denotative function of a visual. The concept of visual as a trigger or catalyst that stimulates the optic nerves to convey information to the brain is the first level that refers to visual as a denotative system. The ‘measuring’ item and other features presented in the visual are used to identify the frame in this context. The reaction from the visual to a certain subject was then structured using frames created from the meanings of recognized elements, composition, and structuring. In the context of this research, visual portrayal of issues reflects the manifest, denotative and literal meaning of image.

4. *Underlying Meaning of Visual Frames*

According to Rodriguez and Dimitrova (2011), subjects and objects don't just relate to specific people or actual items but also to the meaning and concepts that go with them. In understanding the underlying meaning of visual, most literature turns to semiotics as a theory that binds this particular area of knowledge (Ferguson & Greer, 2018; Rovisco, 2017; Stoian,

2015). The study of signals and signifying practices is known as semiotics. A sign is defined as any entity, such as phrases, pictures, or things, that refers to something else. Semiotics investigates how this referencing arises from historically defined social conventions (Eco, 1979).

Semiotics, in other words, demonstrates how the relationship between the symbol and the 'something else' stems from what our culture has told us. The study of semiotics concerns the fact that the relation is neither inevitable nor necessary. Signifying practices simply refer to how, rather than what, meaning is produced, and a code is the social convention that connects signs with meanings (Potts, 1996). Images and artefacts do not, in and of themselves, provide meaning. The meaning we assign to pictures and objects is distinct from the image or entity. In other words, pictures and events may function as signals, and the meaning we assign to the symbol relates to cultural concepts we have encountered and may or may not be conscious of. Furthermore, according to Potts (1996), photographs and objects are not only mediated by conventions but meaning is largely triggered by societal norms. Within the context of this research, the underlying meaning of visual is deemed important to comprehend as through the underlying meaning can the visual be deeply understood to further translate certain messages into actions.

METHODOLOGY

The present study employed in-depth interviews to analyze the underlying meanings and ideological representations of visual frames present on the BERSIH Facebook Page. Purposive sampling, specifically criterion sampling, was used to select informants based on their expertise and experience in visual communication. Expert interviews were utilized to obtain authoritative opinions and credible details from individuals who possess profound knowledge of the research subject. As suggested by Libakova and Sertakova (2015), expert interviews are different from standard in-depth interviews that aim to explore personal life and daily opinions of participants. Formalization of the expert interview is not necessary as it is focused on obtaining serious and competent evaluations of the research subject. The use of expert interviews helps to obtain additional insights and credible opinions on the visual frames presented on the BERSIH Facebook Page.

Fridlund and Hildingh (2000) suggest that qualitative studies typically involve 1 to 30 informants. However, the sample size should be determined based on the informational needs required to answer the research question with sufficient confidence. Guest et al. (2006) conducted research and found that 12 interviews with a homogenous group were sufficient to reach saturation. Therefore, for this particular in-depth interview, 10 informants were interviewed.

This study utilized informants who possess expertise in the realm of visual communication and possess a thorough understanding of framing and propaganda processes within media contexts. The selected informants were individuals such as photojournalists, politicians, and visual professionals.

Table 1: Informants Background in The In-depth Interview Session

No	Organization	Background
Informant 1	Kementerian Komunikasi dan Multimedia	An Ex-Member of Parliament for Sungai Besar constituency. Currently he is holding the position of Political Secretary for Minister of Communication and Multimedia. He is a prolific writer in the area of Propaganda and Politics and has produced more than 8 books on the topic of propaganda and politics.
Informant 2	Members of Parliament	The Member of Parliament for Petaling Jaya constituency and an activist who led the BERSIH rally and formed the Coalition for Clean and Fair Elections 2.0 (Bersih 2.0). She was the chairwoman of Bersih 2.0 from 2013 until 2018. She is also the founding member and former chairperson of All Women's Action Society (AWAM).
Informant 3	Public University	A PhD Holder in Visual symbolism and a senior lecturer in a public university. He has been teaching advertising and also a former art director in an international advertising agency. Currently he is an active visual creator, managing his own YouTube channel that focuses on political issues. He is also a social media strategist on Facebook as well as other social media and is well versed in the area of visual propaganda.
Informant 4	Self Employed	A senior photojournalist based in Malaysia. After getting a Diploma in Photography from ITM, he has since worked for local and international assignments covering politics, sports and human interest issues for international agencies such as Associated Press (AP) and AFP (Agence France Presse). A well known photojournalist among photographers in Malaysia, he gives photography talks to universities and colleges all around Malaysia. Currently retired but still receives invitations for judging and coaching for local and international photography competitions.
Informant 5	Self Employed	A former photojournalist working for international agencies and a selected participant for notable international photo workshops. Experience in dealing with international photography projects and workshops had given him the experience to understand the visual elements that are suitable in reaching the right audience. He is a registered voter and has voted two times in the General Election. He lived and grew up in Selangor.
Informant 6	Selangor State Executive Councillor	Started off in politics as a Malaysian Islamic Party (PAS) member contesting for the N38 Paya Jaras seat. In 2018, he left PAS to join PKR while still holding his position in the N38 Paya Jaras seat. He currently serves as a Selangor State Executive Councillor (EXCO).
Informant 7	Perak State Chairman of PEJUANG	A practising lawyer and politician who work closely with Tun Mahathir in forming the PEJUANG political party. His involvement in politics started when he was a Student's representative council in UiTM. He is currently the Perak State Chairman of PEJUANG and the party's lawyer.
Informant 8	Members Of Parliament	A Malaysian politician who served as a Member of Parliament for Kangar. In the 2018 election, he represented the PKR party and won the Kangar parliamentary seat, defeating Barisan Nasional (BN) candidate Ramli Shariff and giving BN its first defeat for a parliamentary seat in Perlis state since independence.
Informant 9	Self Employed	A website designer and had worked in many social media communication related projects. Dealing with website designing and social media related projects had given him the experience of understanding the elements that worked and suitable in reaching the right audience. He is a registered voter and has voted two times in the General Election. He lived and grew up in Selangor.
Informant 10	Media Prima Berhad	She has been working at TV9 Media Prima after graduated. Working in the Marketing Communication department had earned her the experience in handling and understanding clients and viewers needs in terms of media. She is a registered voter and has voted for two times in the General Election.

5. Thematic Analysis from the In-Depth Interview Data

During the second stage of data inquiry in this research, in-depth interviews were conducted with political and visual experts. The objective of these interviews was two-fold: firstly, to establish the underlying message or connotative visual framing regarding political participation in Malaysia, and secondly, to comprehend the overall visual framing by social movement organizations regarding political participation in Malaysia. The interviews were conducted using open-ended questions that encouraged the informants to express their perspectives on the subject matter and to compare or forecast possible alternatives. Figure 1 in the interview protocol outlines the questions asked of each informant. The expert interviews approach has several significant benefits over data collection approaches. Since the interviewees are highly knowledgeable, there is no need for additional screening or clarification of questions. This approach is designed to produce accurate results, as the participants' expertise is very high (Dorussen et al., 2005). Thematic analysis coding is performed after each interview is transcribed accurately.

<p>Mohd Firdauz Mohd Fathir Jun 2021</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Interview Protocol Understanding Social Media Visual Framing by Social Movement Organization Towards Political Participation In Malaysia: An Analysis On The BERSIH Movement Semi Structured Interview</p> <p>The following questions will be the guidelines for the interview to answer the objectives of the study. Before the start of the interview, the informants will be briefed about the first stage of data enquiry, the content analysis, which had uncover the theme of visual framing from the Social Movement's Organization (SMO) official social media site- <i>Official BERSIH 2.0</i> Facebook page. The question asked will be guided by the result of the content analysis as well as the background and past experience of the informants.</p> <p>Background Questions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please introduce yourself. • What is your education background? • What is your occupational background? • Were you often involved with visuals in your job scope? • Are you aware about BERSIH? What are your thoughts about the movement? <p>This interview session contained three main sections which intend to seek for the informants' point of view about visual framing in social movements. However, the researcher has total authority to proceed, ignore or override any questions that need to be answered according to their urgency.</p> <p>Section A. Questions to identify the underlying messages from the visual portrayals on the SMO's official social media account.</p> <p>1. Looking at the images – can we identify the message it tries to convey? What are your thoughts?</p> <p>Theme 1. Images of crowd Theme 2. Significant individuals Theme 3. Organization's identity Theme 4. Police brutality and unlawful raid</p> <p>2. How about composition and design? Does it imply any underlying messages?</p> <p>a. Image Size (big and small) b. Camera Shots (wide shot vs tight shot) c. Camera Angles (top and low) d. Colours (yellow, red, black and white)</p> <p>3. How does the message play role in political participation in Malaysia?</p>	<p>Mohd Firdauz Mohd Fathir Jun 2021</p> <p>Theme 1. Images of crowd Theme 2. Significant individuals Theme 3. Organization's identity Theme 4. Police brutality and unlawful raid</p> <p>Section B. Questions to understand the motivations for online visual framing by SMO.</p> <p>1. Based on your experience as a media practitioner/politicians/visual experts, to what extent is the importance of visual in putting forth political issue? Please elaborate.</p> <p>2. Why does SMO use visual material to invite the participation of the public?</p> <p>3. How does visual differ from textual in terms of framing an issue?</p> <p>4. How does the internet and social media play role in motivating online visual framing?</p> <p>Section C. Questions to understand the ideological aspects of online visual framing in the context of SMO towards political participation in Malaysia.</p> <p>1. Based on your experience as a media practitioner/politicians/visual expert, which social group do these visuals represent? How does it reflect that certain group? Civilian? Politician? Others?</p> <p>2. What are the dominating ideas conveyed by all these visuals?</p> <p>3. Does the visual reflects any support to a certain political party?</p> <p>Note: The researcher will be assuming more spontaneous questions to be asked during the interview session. This is due to the fact that participants might come out with a better concept of ideas to be shared which can further strengthen the discussion.</p>
--	--

Figure 1: Interview Protocol

The process of thematic analysis commences by identifying the research questions. Thematic analysis has been chosen as the preferred methodology since it has the ability to uncover the underlying themes or narratives present in the Facebook content of BERSIH, thereby facilitating the objective of disseminating information and advocating for the social movement. In this study, the Braun and Clarke (2006) coding process has been adopted for

thematic analysis of the data collected through in-depth interviews. The coding process comprises six phases, namely, familiarization with the data, generation of initial codes, identification of themes, refinement of themes, further refinement of themes, and reporting of themes. The subsequent sections elucidate the intricate procedure involved in each of the phases of thematic analysis.

a) Familiarisation with the Data

Thematic analysis entails the initial stage of familiarizing the data by applying a coding process to identify the framing of the visuals. As the data is in visual form, it necessitates an interpretation process to extract the data from the visuals on social media. This process entails two levels of procedures. The first level entails background and understanding of the researcher, acting as an instrument to interpret the meaning of the visuals, and interpreting the visuals' significance based on reference to past literature, models, and theories. The codes were identified using deductive and inductive processes based on previous literature that adopts a framework to the level of visual framing by Rodriguez and Dimitrova (2011).

The second level of the process involves coding to determine the underlying meaning of the visuals. This procedure includes verifying the underlying message through triangulation and confirmation with visual experts. The codes were identified using deductive and inductive processes based on past literature that adapts a framework in visual framing. According to Braun and Clarke (2006), immersion often involves repeated reading of the data and actively seeking meanings and patterns. Additionally, notes and ideas were carefully taken during this phase to record essential findings during the familiarization process.

b) Generating Initial Codes

The second phase of thematic analysis involves the generation of initial codes. During the first phase, several intriguing ideas and features of the data were recognized. The second phase is centered on creating initial codes for the data. Codes represent the most basic segment or element of the raw data or information that can be evaluated meaningfully regarding the phenomenon. At this stage, the data are coded based on potential themes that emerge from the data. In this process, some deductive codes are employed, adapting the level of visual framing.

The fundamental first level of coding entails identifying the first layer of the photo or, as denoted by Panofsky (1955) the "primary or natural subject matter." The initial code provides answers to the "who" and "what" questions in the image. This phase also necessitates the documentation of notes and comments on codes that may be helpful in later phases. This study employs *Atlas.ti* version 8.4.4 to code the data.

c) Searching for Themes

Following the generation of initial codes during the second phase, the third phase of thematic analysis involves the search for themes after coding all of the data. During this stage, all coded data are organized into potential themes. This is the stage where the researcher begins to make sense of the data. Codes are grouped according to potential themes, for instance, the code protest, protestors, and crowd are grouped under the theme "participants of the social movement." To accomplish this, the researcher utilizes the "code manager" feature in *Atlas.ti* to organize relevant codes into an overarching theme. While some initial codes are employed to form the primary theme, others are used to create sub-themes, and those not chosen are not discarded as the researcher perceives they may contribute to meaning in later stages. This

phase culminates in the collection of themes, sub-themes, and all coded data in connection to the themes. These outcomes will be elaborated on in detail in the subsequent chapter.

d) Refining Themes

The fourth phase of the thematic analysis process involves refining the themes. This study adopts Patton's (1999) dual criteria for evaluating categories, namely internal homogeneity and external heterogeneity. The first criterion assesses the meaningful cohesiveness of the data within a given category, while the second criterion evaluates the distinctness and clarity of differences among categories.

e) Further Refinement of Themes

The fifth stage of thematic analysis entails further refining the themes. This phase involves organizing the codes that were grouped under each theme into a coherent and internally reliable narrative. Each theme undergoes a detailed analysis, and a comprehensive write-up is produced. For instance, the theme "expressing disgust" refers to images that convey disdain towards a specific entity or organization, such as the government, while the theme "international support" refers to images that depict backing from the international community or personalities. The process also checks whether each theme has any subthemes. By the end of this stage, the themes are thoroughly defined, and the researcher will utilize Patton's dual criteria for judging to ensure that they are precisely articulated and distinguished from one another.

f) Reporting the Themes

The final phase of thematic analysis is the reporting of the themes and processes employed. It is noteworthy, however, that most of the processes involved in the thematic analysis were customized and utilized to address the research question in this study. The outcomes of the analysis are presented in the subsequent section.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Underlying Visual Frames

Following the analysis of visual portrayal from content analysis of the samples, which uncovered the manifest level of the visual content, a thematic analysis from an in-depth interview with ten informants was done to further interpret the underlying meaning of the visual contents. Within the context of this research, three themes were finalized. They are the portrayal of the crowd, the portrayal of significant individuals and the portrayal of injustice. The themes were formed based on the ten subthemes derived from the analysis, detailed in the subchapters below.

Table 2: Themes and subthemes derived from in-depth Interview with informants

Item	Theme	Subthemes
(i)	<i>Portrayal of Crowd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">● <i>Sense of assurance</i>● <i>The bandwagon effects</i>● <i>The cool factor</i>
(ii)	<i>The portrayal of Significant Individual</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">● <i>Inciting people's anger</i>● <i>Providing a sense of leadership</i>● <i>Validation of support</i>● <i>Subjectivity in perception</i>

Item	Theme	Subthemes
(iii)	<i>Portrayal of Injustice</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Gaining sympathy</i> ● <i>Getting attention</i> ● <i>Fuelling emotion</i>
TOTAL		10

II. Portrayal of Crowd

Images that portray crowds and gathering people seem to dominate most qualitative visual content analysis samples. According to the informants, these images are essential to provide several messages. The first is to provide a sense of assurance. Secondly, to impose a bandwagon effect. Thirdly, the portrayal of the crowd would portray a sense of cool factor.

Pictures of a large crowd can give the impression of a trusted movement that is supported by the majority of the people, which in turn attracts more people and increases the movement's influence. Informants corroborate this, with one stating that "by showing all the crowd, people who doubt will start to trust" and another adding that "people who go to the street is support".

The bandwagon effect is another theme emerged, where propaganda is used to influence and entice people through media. The portrayal of the crowd in these images serves as a form of propaganda, triggering the bandwagon effect in its viewers. Seeing a large number of people supporting a social movement can elicit curiosity and a desire to join, thereby increasing the movement's followers. One informant notes that the bandwagon effect is "part of what I believe is the whole thing other than the art of photography", suggesting that the use of visual propaganda is deliberate and effective.

Finally, the cool factor is a theme that emerges from the analysis. Informants note that the images of the crowd often convey a sense of energy, passion, and excitement, which can make the movement appear more attractive to potential followers. The use of bold and creative visuals, such as banners and posters, can also add to the cool factor of the movement. One informant shares that "images of crowd showing support and solidarity for the people" can make the movement seem more appealing, while another notes that "the movement has to be cool and hip to attract people".

Overall, the visual framing of social movements on social media is a deliberate and effective strategy to convey a sense of assurance, trigger the bandwagon effect, and enhance the cool factor of the movement. Through the use of images of a large and enthusiastic crowd, social movements can increase their influence and attract more followers.

III. Portrayal of Significant Individual

Images of important personnel related to the movement was identified as the second most recurrent theme. Within images of BERSIH, significant individuals like politicians and activists were usually portrayed several times in its Facebook page using poster designs and photographs. According to the informants, portrayal of significant individuals had several messages to be conveyed. Some reason is to incite people's anger, provide a sense of leadership, and validate support. However, these perceptions can be subjective based on the background and preconception of the viewers. The elaboration is detailed in the following paragraphs.

One purpose of the portrayal of political figures and popular individuals was to incite people's anger. The use of figures like former Prime Minister YAB Dato Seri Najib Tun Razak was mainly to create more anger towards the government. Several informants, such as Informant 10, believe that "putting such significant figure will create more anger." Informant 3 states that the image of Najib Razak became the source of anger, conveying the message that "if the election happened, this guy manipulate the election. This guy who makes us angry will keep on reigning with power."

Providing a sense of leadership was also a dominant theme. Within visual framing, figures of leaders can be influential in motivating viewers to take action. Leaders and followers are interchangeable aspects in a social movement. Some of the figures used in the BERSIH social media were popular activists voicing out BERSIH demand on public and in the media. Figures like Maria Chin, the leader of BERSIH, and Tun Mahathir, the former prime minister of Malaysia, were shown in some of the images and have attracted high engagement in terms of like and share. Informant 1 explains that "these kinds of portrayal provide a certain sense of leader figure towards the follower, and it may well be a big factor that 'green light' their followers to join the movement."

Validation of support was the final theme that emerged. Informants believe that the use of political figures and popular individuals validated the support for the BERSIH movement. Informant 3 elaborates that "when you see that people are coming out (for the movement), and you see that there are a few (political) personalities that are actually there as well, that's a sign of support." Additionally, Informant 1 states that "if we can observe the turnout during BERSIH 5, there is Tun Mahathir, Muhyiddin and all. All of these individuals have their own crowd. So, when they turn up, it will indicate (there is) support."

IV. Portrayal of Injustice

Images of injustices and oppressions like images of police brutality and unfair execution by the government had always been one of the popular framing in collective action frames (Benford & Snow, 2000). Within images of BERSIH, police were usually portrayed several times in its Facebook page using poster designs and photographs. According to the informants, the portrayal of injustice had several messages. The first reason is to gain sympathy. Secondly, portrayal of injustice can help escalate the popularity of the movement. The rarity and sensational elements of the images of injustice police act can trigger people's emotions and eventually escalate the movement's popularity. Thirdly, portrayal of injustice would fuel the anger and emotional element among the followers and the people at large.

The analysis of the data collected from the informants regarding the BERSIH movement in Malaysia has been divided into three themes, which are gaining sympathy, getting attention, and fueling emotion. One of the major themes is gaining sympathy through the portrayal of oppression and injustice in the system. The informants have highlighted that sympathy is an emotion that is commonly triggered when certain wrongdoing is being done towards a certain individual or organization. The portrayal of police injustice was meant to escalate the feeling of unfairness and gain sympathy from the crowd, as it is an injustice being done to them. From gaining sympathy, they also gain more trust and more support from the community.

The second theme is getting attention, which is crucial for any social movement to thrive. The informants have emphasized that the 'virality' of a certain related issue to the movement can be an advantage in the context of escalating popularity. The images of police

brutality have increased the popularity and the reputation of the movement as it gets the attention of the international community. This has indeed given more pressure to the government during that time, and the international reaction was very strong.

The third theme is fuelling emotion, as emotion is one key area that is discussed in many political and social movements' arguments. The informants have highlighted that the images with significant individuals represent and trigger emotions. Visuals can give a lot of emotions towards one situation, and it gives a lot of emotions in one situation. The photos that are being presented are photos that have emotions, such as the photos when Tun Mahathir was giving a speech, which is emotion. The banners that are displayed are all emotion, as they fuel emotions and provoke people to act. Overall, the analysis highlights the importance of gaining sympathy, getting attention, and fueling emotion in any social movement.

CONCLUSION

This study contributes to the existing research on social movement organization by addressing a gap in the literature, namely the unique visual framing strategies employed by these organizations to encourage political participation. The findings of this study suggest that visual framing in social movements has a significant impact on people's emotions towards political participation, both at the early stages of the movement and during and after its progression. It is noteworthy that the notion of emotion is not limited to basic, active emotions such as anger and hatred, as the study identified neutrality and the "cool factor" as feelings that can generate emotion, such as the anticipation that can draw people towards the movement. Through the use of a non-direct strategy that portrays apolitical motives, the movement effectively engages its supporters in discussions and indirectly encourages more individuals to participate in political discourse. These results can impact academically as well as practically in social and political area especially in terms of how underlying message and approach in visuals can further contribute towards participation. Future research is recommended to look into more advanced methodological approaches to obtain more robust data and intricate analysis to analyse the abstract character of visual data and the complex path of social media data. For example, future research can utilize big data analysis or eye movement analysis to extract more information regarding visual data.

BIODATA

Mohd Firdauz Mohd Fathir is a senior lecturer at the Faculty of Communication and Media Studies, UiTM Cawangan Negeri Sembilan, Rembau Campus. His research interests include Visual Communication, Media Warfare, Kansei Engineering and Visual Propaganda. Email: mfirdauz@uitm.edu.my

Anitawati Mohd Lokman is a professor of IT at Universiti Teknologi MARA Malaysia. Her main research areas include Emotional User Experience, Kansei Engineering, Emotion & Design, and Emotion & Wellbeing. She is a Professional Technologist and a Senior Member of IEEE. Email: anitawati@uitm.edu.my

Shamsiah Abd Kadir is a senior lecturer at Centre for Research in Media and Communication and also a research fellow in UKM x UNICEF Communication for Development in Health (HEALTHCOMM). Her research interest includes Health Communication, Kansei Engineering, Emotion & Well-being, and Media & Information Warfare. Email: shamkadir@ukm.edu.my

Ismail Sualman is a professor of communication at Universiti Teknologi MARA Malaysia. He is an active speaker and trainer in the field of journalism, editing, scholarly writing, and professional writing as well as political analyst in Malaysia. Email: ismail952@uitm.edu.my

REFERENCES

- Barthes, R. (1964). *Rhetoric of the image*. *Communications*, 4, 40-51. <https://doi.org/cvg7cb>
- Benford, R. D., & Snow, D. A. (2000). Framing processes and social movements: An overview and assessment. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 46(8), 1743–1757. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/223459>
- Benkler, Y. (2006). *The wealth of networks: How social production transforms markets and freedom*. Yale University Press. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1njknw>
- Bennett, W. L., & Segerberg, A. (2012). The logic of connective action: Digital media and the personalization of contentious politics. *Information, Communication & Society*, 15(5), 739–768. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118x.2012.670661>
- Bock, M. A. (2020). Theorising visual framing: contingency, materiality and ideology. *Visual Studies*, 35(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1472586X.2020.1715244>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Hitlin, P., & Olmstead, K. (2018, March 21). 2. User engagement with posts on science-related Facebook pages is more common for visual posts, calls to action. *Pew Research Center*. <https://www.pewresearch.org/science/2018/03/21/user-engagement-with-posts-on-science-related-facebook-pages-is-more-common-for-visual-posts-calls-to-action/>
- Chinnasamy, S., & Abdul Manaf, N. (2018). Social media as political hatred mode in Malaysia's 2018 General Election. *SHS Web of Conferences*, 53(October), 02005. <https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/20185302005>
- Coleman, R. (2009). Framing the pictures in our heads: Exploring the framing and agenda-setting effects of visual images. In P. D'Angelo & J. A. Kuypers (Eds.), *Doing news framing analysis: Empirical and theoretical perspectives* (pp. 233–261). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203864463>
- DeLuca, K. M., Lawson, S., & Sun, Y. (2012). Occupy Wall Street on the public screens of social media: The many framings of the birth of a protest movement. *Communication, Culture & Critique*, 5(4), 483–509. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1753-9137.2012.01141.x>
- Dorussen, H., Lenz, H., & Blavoukos, S. (2005). Assessing the reliability and validity of expert interviews. *European Union Politics*, 6(3), 315–337. <https://doi.org/b64fh2>
- Duggan, B. Y. M., & Brenner, J. (2013, February 14). Internet & technology. *Pew Research Center*. <https://www.pewresearch.org/internet/2013/02/14/the-demographics-of-social-media-users-2012/>
- Eco, U. (1979). *A theory of semiotics*. Indiana University Press.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing - Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51–58. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1993.tb01304.x>
- Fahmy, S., Bock, M. A., & Wanta, W. (2014). *Visual communication theory and research: A mass communication perspective*. Palgrave Macmillan. <https://doi.org/hkdt>
- Ferguson, D. A., & Greer, C. F. (2018). Visualizing a non-visual medium through social media: The semiotics of radio station posts on Instagram. *Journal of Radio and Audio Media*, 25(1), 126-141. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19376529.2017.1385617>
- Fridlund, B., & Hildingh, C. (2000). *Qualitative research, methods in the service of health*. Studentlitteratur AB.
- Gamson, W. A., & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media discourse and public opinion on nuclear power: A constructionist approach. *American Journal of Sociology*, 95(1), 1–37. <https://doi.org/10.1086/229213>
- Geise, S. (2017). *Visual framing*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc. <https://doi.org/hw79>

- Gerbaudo, P. (2015). Protest avatars as memetic signifiers: political profile pictures and the construction of collective identity on social media in the 2011 protest wave. *Information Communication and Society*, 18(8), 916-929. <https://doi.org/gcp3qb>
- González-Bailón, S., & Wang, N. (2016). Networked discontent: The anatomy of protest campaigns in social media. *Social Networks*, 44, 95-104. <https://doi.org/f75jvs>
- Gretzel, U. (2018). 62. Tourism and social media. In Cooper, C., Volo, S., Gartner, W. C., & Scott, N. (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of tourism management* (Vol. 2, Part. 5, pp. 415-432). Sage.
- Kirkpatrick, D. D., & Sanger, D. E. (2011). A Tunisian-Egyptian link that shook Arab history. *The New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2011/02/14/world/middleeast/14egypt-tunisia-protests.html>
- Libakova, N. M., & Sertakova, E. A. (2015). The method of expert interview as an effective research procedure of studying the indigenous peoples of the North. *Journal of Siberian Federal University. Humanities & Social Sciences*, 1(8), 114-129. <https://doi.org/10.17516/1997-1370-2015-8-1-114-129>
- Lim, M. (2016). Sweeping the unclean: Social media and the bersih electoral reform movement in Malaysia abstract online activism in Malaysia. *Global Media Journal*, 14(27), 1-10.
- Mattoni, A., & Teune, S. (2014). Visions of protest: A media-historic perspective on images in social movements. *Sociology Compass*, 8(6), 876-887. <https://doi.org/gcp3qf>
- Panofsky, E. (1955). *Meaning in the visual arts: Papers in and on art history*. Doubleday & Company, Inc.
- Parry, K. (2010). A visual framing analysis of British press photography during the 2006 Israel-Lebanon conflict. *Media, War and Conflict*, 3(1), 67-85. <https://doi.org/cwhzsz>
- Patton, M. Q. (1999). Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health Services Research*, 34(5 Pt 2), 1189-1208.
- Potts, A. (1996). Sign. In R. S. Nelson & R. Schiff (Eds.), *Critical terms for art history* (p. 20). University of Chicago Press.
- Rodriguez, L., & Dimitrova, D. V. (2011). The levels of visual framing. *Journal of Visual Literacy*, 30(1), 48-65. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23796529.2011.11674684>
- Rovisco, M. (2017). The indignados social movement and the image of the occupied square: the making of a global icon. *Visual Communication*, 16(3), 337-359. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470357217702088>
- Rovisco, M., & Veneti, A. (2017). Picturing protest: Visuality, visibility and the public sphere. *Visual Communication*, 16(3), 271-277. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470357217704633>
- Salim, L. (2018, December 8). Ada apa dengan Himpunan 812? *Astro Awani*. <https://www.astroawani.com/berita-malaysia/ada-apa-dengan-himpunan-812-193107>
- Stern, P. C., Dietz, T., Abel, T., Guagnano, G. A., & Kalof, L. (1999). A value-belief-norm theory of support for social movements: The case of environmentalism. *Human Ecology Review*, 6(2), 81-97.
- Stoian, C. E. (2015). Analysing images: A social semiotic perspective. *Scientific Bulletin of the Politehnica University of Timișoara Transactions on Modern Languages*, 14(1).
- Sulaiman, N., & Aboo Talib @ Khalid, K. (2017). Will there be Malaysia spring? A comparative assessment on social movements. *Jurnal Komunikasi, Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 33(1), 43-58. <https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2017-3301-04>

- Treré, E., & Mattoni, A. (2016). Media ecologies and protest movements: main perspectives and key lessons. *Information Communication and Society*, 19(3), 290-306. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2015.1109699>
- Tye, M., Leong, C., Tan, F. T. C., Tan, B., & Khoo, Y. H. (2018). Social media for empowerment in social movements: The case of Malaysia's grassroots activism. *Communications of the Association for Information Systems*, 42(1), 408–430. <https://doi.org/gf5jvg>
- Zhuravskaya, E., Petrova, M., & Enikolopov, R. (2020). Political effects of the internet and social media. *Annual Review of Economics*, 12, 415–438. <https://www.annualreviews.org/doi/10.1146/annurev-economics-081919-050239>